



## **FIRST MEETING OF THE GOVERNOR'S COMMISSION ON CLIMATE CHANGE**

February 1, 2008, 3:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.

General Assembly Building, House Room D

Richmond, Virginia

---

### **I. Attendance**

The following Commission members were present for the meeting: The Honorable L. Preston Bryant, Jr., The Honorable Patrick O. Gottschalk, The Honorable Pierce R. Homer, Mr. Stephen A. Walz, Ms. LuAnn L. Bennett, The Honorable Donald S. Beyer, Jr., The Honorable Joseph F. Bouchard, The Honorable David L. Bulova, Ms. Christine Chmura, The Honorable John W. Daniel, II, The Honorable R. Creigh Deeds, The Honorable Paul Ferguson, Mr. Robert J. Fledderman, Mr. Stuart A. Freudberg, Mr. Felix Garcia, Mr. Dale A. Gardner, The Honorable John H. (Jack) Gibbons, Ms. Jodi Gidley, Mr. William S. Greenleaf, The Honorable Penelope A. Gross, Mr. David A. Heacock, Ms. Ann F. Jennings, Dr. Roger Mann, The Honorable Robert E. Martínez, The Honorable Joe T. May, Mr. Tyrone W. Murray, The Honorable Ralph S. Northam, Mr. R. Paul Orentas, The Honorable Kenneth R. Plum, Mr. Oliver A. Pollard, III, Mr. Michael J. Quillen, The Honorable Ron Rordam, Mr. Harrison B. Rue, The Honorable Bruce Smart, Mr. William A. "Skip" Stiles, Dr. Lydia W. Thomas, Mr. Michael S. Townes, and The Honorable Frank W. Wagner.

Those not in attendance were: Mr. R. Daniel Carson, Jr., The Reverend Richard Cizik, Mr. Robert F. Hemphill, Jr., Mr. Michael L. Lipford, and Dr. Jagadish Shukla.

### **II. Opening Remarks**

The Honorable Timothy M. Kaine welcomed the Commission on Climate Change (Commission), which was established on December 21, 2007, by Executive Order 59. In his opening remarks, Governor Kaine summarized the underlying reasons for establishing the Commission and conveyed his expectations that the Commission will deliver by the end of 2008 a set of recommendations to address impacts of climate change.

- There is significant motivation and increasing momentum at the state level to address climate change.
- Climate change is expected to have considerable impacts on the Commonwealth by affecting some 112 miles of coastline, our busy shipping ports, military installations, industries, forestry and agriculture, utilities, and populations residing along coastal areas.
- The four overall goals of the Virginia Energy Plan, including the efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 30 percent by 2025, present a challenge to

devise strategies that take into consideration land use, population projections, emergency response systems, and infrastructure.

- Additionally, it is important to consider relative energy demand and supply. Energy conservation and efficiency are very important.

The Governor shared his desire to highlight recommendations put forth by the Commission when he attends the upcoming Southern Governors' Association. In closing, the Governor expressed his thanks to Commission members for agreeing to serve.

### III. Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) Presentation.

Roger Chaffe, Senior Assistant Attorney General

The Governor's Commission on Climate Change is an advisory committee – a public body that is subject to the open meeting requirements of FOIA. A number of state laws and procedures do not apply, but the Conflict Act and FOI Act do apply. Referencing his presentation, Mr. Chaffee

highlighted FOIA definitions:

- Public Body;
- Meeting (as many of 3 people);
- Public Records (most exemptions would probably **not** apply with respect to this commission).

and reviewed legal issues of FOIA:

- Closed sessions;
- Making sure adequate public notice is given for meetings;
- Meeting minutes;
- Electronic meetings.

#### Public access

Chairman Bryant called attention to the Commission's website -- <http://www.deq.virginia.gov/info/climatechange.html> -- hosted by DEQ. All meeting presentations are available on the website. The website also provides an opportunity for public input: [climatechange@deq.virginia.gov](mailto:climatechange@deq.virginia.gov).

### IV. Executive Order 59 Presentation

Nikki Rovner, Deputy Secretary of Natural Resources

Deputy Secretary Rovner walked Commission members through Executive Order 59 and emphasized several key elements:

- The goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 30 percent by 2025;
- The Climate Change Action Plan will identify actions needed to achieve the goal.
- The E.O. directs the Commission to take a look at approaches used by other states and other areas of the country;

- That Commission members have one year to complete their work – the report is due December 15, 2008; and
- No funding has been appropriated for the Commission.

## V. The Virginia Energy Plan and Executive Order 48

Stephen Walz, Senior Advisor for Energy

The Virginia Energy Plan was prepared pursuant to 2006 legislation that had been sponsored by Commission member Senator Wagner, and the plan was completed in September of 2007. The plan addresses energy resources and consumption, energy efficiency and conservation, energy infrastructure, energy and the environment, and energy research and development and contains recommendations in all of those areas. One of the four key goals of the Virginia Energy Plan was the goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 30 percent by 2025. Actions recommended in the Plan for renewable energy and energy efficiency and conservation are projected to result in a 15% reduction. The Plan recommended the establishment of the Commission on Climate Change to identify the actions needed for the additional 15% needed to achieve the goal.

Executive Order 48 calls on state government to lead by example by requiring state agencies to reduce conventional energy costs by 20% and take other actions. The E.O. also established the Governor's Energy Policy Advisory Council. Some of the energy-related issues that arise during the deliberations of the Commission on Climate Change may be referred to the Energy Policy Advisory Council for further study or action.

## VI. Proposed Work Plan

Nikki Rovner, Deputy Secretary of Natural Resources

Nikki Rovner reviewed contents of the draft work plan, which outlined the objectives of the eight Commission meetings. Chairman Bryant noted that the proposed plan seeks to take a very balanced approach. For example, in the third meeting Commission members want to hear from businesses – from multi-state companies with regard to what they are experiencing elsewhere.

Chairman Bryant received comments from Committee members. The Chairman's responses to questions included the following points:

- Future meetings will probably be all-day meetings, from approximately 10 a.m. to 4 p.m.;
- Built into each meeting is a roundtable discussion and public comment opportunity;
- The Commission is operating under Executive Order 59, which sets the parameters of its work.
- The Commission will need to do some cost benefit analysis and look at new modeling data; and

- The Chairman will be actively seeking input from Commission members for names of individuals who would serve as scientific resources and provide expert advice.

**Approval of the Plan.**

Chairman Bryant called for a motion to adopt the Plan, subject to modifications that had been suggested during the Commission's discussion of the plan. Chairman Bryant promised to send out a final revision within a few days after the meeting. The Commission voted unanimously to follow this approach.

**VII. Greenhouse Gas Inventory for Virginia**

Tom Ballou, Virginia Department of Environmental Quality

Mr. Ballou's slide presentation provided described the results of Virginia's first-ever greenhouse gas inventory. Of note is that Virginia joined the Climate Registry in May, 2007. Based on questions from Commission members, Mr. Ballou indicated he would provide more statistics for future presentations, such as per capita energy consumption.

**VIII. Public Comments**

- Bill Cunningham of Union for Jobs in the Environment expressed support the Commission's work; however he urged the Commission to not recommend a cap and trade program.
- Glenn Besa of the Sierra Club cited urgency in the need to take action on climate change.
- Joshua Tulkin of the Chesapeake Climate Action Network encouraged: (1) engagement of students at the universities hosting Commission meetings, and (2) investigating the viability of energy plans.
- Karl Bren of Earth Craft, VA urged the Commission to rise to the challenge and look to the "low-hanging fruit" of conservation. He recommended conservation on a large scale.
- Michael Town, Virginia Chapter of the Sierra Club urged the Commission to schedule meetings at times that allow working people to speak their minds and not have to take off work.

**IX. Adjournment**

Chairman Bryant adjourned the meeting at 5:05 p.m.